

Report from ASCSU January 17-18, 2019

John Tarjan and Janet Millar

1. **Chair Nelson** provided us with a brief oral report after distributing a more comprehensive report. Chair Nelson's current and past chair reports can be found at http://www.calstate.edu/AcadSen/Records/Chairs_Reports/
2. **Excerpts from Other Reports**
 - **Academic Affairs** discussed the following topics.
 - Campus Academic Master Plans and State Workforce Needs
 - Doctorate in Occupational Therapy
 - Graduation Initiative 2025
 - Faculty Intellectual Property and Course Hero's Use of Faculty Materials
 - Cal Grant B Awards
 - GE Task Force Preliminary Report
 - Their Pending Resolutions (see below)
 - **Academic Preparation and Education Programs** discussed the following topics.
 - Update on the WestEd study looking at implementation of EO 1110, including classification categories for courses developed for students and very preliminary results—the results seem promising in terms of student pass rates and earning of baccalaureate credits.
 - Associate Degrees for Transfer Report (see BOT Educational Policies Agenda for the full report)
 - Composition and Appointment of Faculty Discipline Review Groups (C-ID Project)
 - Early Start Programs in Light of EO 1110 Changes to Student Preparation
 - Facilitating Consultation with Campus Discipline Faculty on Curricular Matters
 - Their Pending Resolutions (see below)
 - **Faculty Affairs** discussed the following topics.
 - State Budget Allocation to the Public University Systems to Support Unconscious Bias Training (allocation controlled by UC)
 - Allocation of \$25m for Tenure-track Hiring
 - Evaluation of Online Teaching
 - CSU, Fresno's "Principles of Community"
 - Scanning of Faculty Computers for "Sensitive Materials." This has been rolled out on 4 campuses already (including Bakersfield), looking for things like SSNs, student contact information, etc.
 - Use of Grade Distributions in RTP
 - Course Hero (posting of course materials without permission)
 - Requests for Instructor/Grade Information
 - Status and Rights of Non-T/TT faculty
 - Presidential Searches
 - Their Pending Resolutions (see below)
 - **Fiscal and Governmental Affairs** discussed the following topics.
 - Funding for the Electronic Core Collection
 - Support of the Governor's Budget
 - Completion and Attrition

- Per-unit Tuition vs. Tiered Rates
- Examination of Campus Budget Practices
- Cal Grant B Program
- Relative Roles of State Support and Tuition in Funding Higher Education
- Completion of the Directory of ASCSU Legislative District Representatives, Including Representatives of the Areas Served by Satellite Campuses

- **Faculty Trustee Recommending Committee**

- Has met and reviewed the candidates nominated by the campuses.
- A link to the nominations of those being forwarded for ASCSU consideration will be distributed shortly.
- The following individuals were forwarded to ASCSU for consideration for recommendation to the Governor. At least 2 names need to be sent to the Governor for appointment consideration.
 - Romey Sabalius (San José)
 - Beth Steffel (San Bernardino)
 - John Tarjan (Bakersfield)

- **GE Advisory Committee** discussed the following issues.

- Report from the GE Task Force
- Review of campus GE Maps (just under half of the campuses have submitted)
- Relevant ASCCC resolutions
- Standardization of GE Across the System as a Result of EO 1100(rev.) Implementation—Upper-Division Reciprocity, Interpretation of the EO, Flexibility within Areas, etc.

- **GE Task Force**

- Will have a report by the end of the academic year.
- Are vetting a conceptual model of student learning outcomes for general education.
- Are anxious to soon send out a preliminary report to get feedback. The conceptual model was reviewed by GEAC and AAC this week. Both committees provided useful feedback.

3. In response to questions regarding EO 1110 implementation results, **AVC James Minor** share a slide that detailed some preliminary results from the WestEd study. AVC Minor noted that these results are “very, very, very preliminary.” A MUCH higher percentage of students passed a GE math course with a grade of C- or better in the fall of 2018 than in the fall of 2017, (Tarjan Note: student subject mastery is not a part of these assessment efforts They focus on pass rates and campus strategies for addressing EO 1110.) Adjustments may need to be made to the Early Start programs in response to the policy changes contained in EO 1110.

4. **Faculty Trustee Sabalius** happily reported a healthy Governor’s budget recommendation for the CSU. We do not anticipate any tuition increases this year as a result. We were treated very fairly relative to the other segments of higher education. The Board has a strategy of asking for one-time funds for programs like those meeting student basic needs, first demonstrating success in using those funds, and then asking for continuing funds when success is demonstrated. Some feel we might be bolder in asking for permanent funding for programs up front. We anticipate lobbying efforts will focus on increased funding for enrollment growth. We have not received an increase in capital debt

service funding, likely because of the proposed state bond issue that would be targeted to support new construction in the UC and CSU. Faculty Trustee written reports can be found at http://www.calstate.edu/AcadSen/Records/Faculty_Trustee/index.shtml

4. We passed the following resolutions upon second reading. Copies of these and other resolutions can be found at <http://www.calstate.edu/AcadSen/Records/Resolutions/>.
 - a. **Adoption of “Tenets of System Level Governance in the California State University”** is self-explanatory. This document was vetted by the campuses and much feedback was received. The resolution was discussed at length in the ASCSU over past few months and several changes were made to perfect the resolution.
 - b. **A Call for the Inclusion of Tuition in the Cal Grant B Award Program for Freshman Students in the CSU** This program currently does not provide funds to low-income freshmen to cover tuition.
 - c. **Increased Funding for the Electronic Core Collection (ECC)** Not only is this collection used by all 23 campuses, but this approach to acquisitions continues to save our campuses significant resources every year. The system allocation for this collection has not been increased in almost 10 years, despite rising costs.
 - d. **Closing the Achievement Gap and Increasing College Completer Outcomes and Success for All CSU Students** supports this goal, commends the CSU’s commitment to achieving this goal, applauds the GI 2025 initiative for its commitment to the goal, commends the CSU Institute for Teaching & Learning for its support in reaching this goal, lists factors affecting equity, and asks that additional analyses be conducted to look at equity in other outcomes such as major selection and employment experiences after graduation. It also requests that student success data continue to be disaggregated demographically.
 - e. **Encouraging Responsible Curriculum Development and Modification Under the Higher Education Employer-Employee Relations Act (HEERA)** Expresses concern about the flawed approach to shared governance evidenced in the development and implementation of EOs 1100(rev.) and 1110, laments that this approach to governance may stifle experimentation and adoption of best practices, encourages campus senates to exercise their control over the curriculum, and encourages the CSU administration to engage in data-driven and genuine consultation regarding the future of these two executive orders.
 - f. **Requirements for Faculty Discipline Review Group (FDRG) Membership in Support of the Development and Oversight of Transfer Model Curricula** clarifies the criteria, terms, and process for these appointments. These individuals oversee the Transfer Model Curricula (TMCs) that can be incorporated into CCC campus Associate Degrees for Transfer and the content of the courses which populate these degrees.
 - g. **Creation of California State University Curriculum Networks** encourages the Chancellor’s Office to maintain contact lists of appropriate faculty for all disciplines for which a Transfer Model Curriculum or Model Curriculum exists and support electronic communications for those groups to facilitate needed disciplinary discussions.
 - h. **Examining the Impact of Attrition and Enrollment Growth on the Number of CSU Students** asserts that increasing graduation rates, in and of themselves, may not increase the number of graduates over time, encourages the CSU to recognize the impact of student attrition, urges the creation of a task force to examine student attrition, and supports the request of additional state funding to fully support an

increase in the number of students served by the CSU. Background information related to this resolution can be found at <https://www.dropbox.com/s/d9eesjag7mnyqy/Stohs-Schutte%20-%20Oct%202018%20Grad%20Rate%20Myth.pdf?dl=0>.

5. We passed the following resolutions after waiving a second reading. Normally first reading items are distributed to campuses for feedback. However, if the ASCSU deems an item to be urgent (e.g. the need to provide input before a policy or piece of legislation is being considered) it may waive the second reading. Copies of these and other resolutions can be found at <http://www.calstate.edu/AcadSen/Records/Resolutions/>.
 - a. **Apportionment of Academic Senate CSU (ASCSU) Seats** addresses our mandate to ensure that the 7 largest campuses (based upon FTEF) are appointed a third seat on ASCSU during the coming year. No changes are required for next year's apportionment of senators across campuses.
 - b. **Response to the Governor's 2019 Budget Proposal** expresses appreciation for the Governor's proposed budget and expresses the need for more funding to adequately address additional priorities including more enrollment growth and deferred maintenance. This budget, if adopted, is likely the largest increase in combined base and one-time funding in the history of the CSU.
 - c. **Appreciation for New Academic CSU Offices** acknowledges our gratitude for the increased space and functionality of the new office and to CO individuals and ASCSU staff involved in the allocation and move.

6. We introduced the following resolutions that will be considered for adoption at our March plenary. Copies of these resolutions should be available shortly for campus review.
 - a. **The Impact of Artificial Intelligence (AI) on Higher Education** endorses a white paper on the impact of AI on employment, education, etc. and calls for the creation of a task force to study the implications of the themes from this white paper and to develop possible recommendations to address them.
 - b. **Border Issues and Separation of Families: Impact on Students, Faculty and Staff in the CSU** calls upon the CSU to continue to support immigrant students, faculty and staff to increase programs to support these communities.

7. **Jennifer Eagan (CFA President)** reported the following.
 - The budget news is extremely positive. Governor Newsom has been even more supportive of the CSU than we expected.
 - There is money for 2% enrollment growth to augment rolled-over enrollment growth money.
 - There is money for increased tenure-track hiring.
 - There are funds for support of undocumented students for legal services.
 - The most promising way to increase graduation rates is to hire more faculty and offer more sections of classes. A 4-year graduation rate may not be the most appropriate measure of graduation success given our student body.
 - We are examining the potential to a return to the CA Master Plan tuition-free model. The waiving of CCC second-year tuition may be a step in that direction.
 - CFA is working on a follow-up training program to supplement their unconscious bias training.
 - We are looking at an audit of campus-based fees.

- President Eagan also shared an overview of the CFA legislative agenda. <https://www.calfac.org/politics>
- We look forward to working with Governor Newsom.

8. Trustee Peter J. Taylor shared his extensive background in higher education, state government, energy and investments, and in the non-profit sector (foundations). Most of his work has been related to finance. He is currently Chair of the Committee on Educational Policy. He is very supportive of building communication and other skills into our students' learning experiences. He solicited feedback on online education, particularly undergraduate online education and the role of artificial intelligence in education. He also asked for our perspectives of the relative roles of a system office and the twenty-three universities. He worries about using undergraduate tuition to subsidize graduate programs. He feels that undergraduate education is a very important part of our mission. Coming to the Board after being the UC CFO for five years, he was very surprised at how low the CSU tenure density is. He is relieved that we have enough funds proposed in the Governor's proposed budget to make a dent in addressing needs like increasing tenure density. He is interested in perhaps increasing our commitment to professional graduate programs. Quality education cannot be achieved "on the cheap." This is the reason why he advocated for the last tuition increase during difficult financial times. He is mindful of the need to balance administrative needs with the importance of ensuring and financially supporting a quality educational experience for our students. ASCSU engaged with Trustee Taylor in a robust session with questions and concerns. Trustee Taylor was very receptive to concerns expressed about educational quality, the insufficiency of resources to support it, and policies that might not be optimal to achieve our student outcome goals.

9. Chancellor Tim White began by recapping the many positive interactions CSU leadership has had with representatives, leaders, and staff in Sacramento. There is a recognition of the critical role the CSU plays for the state in transforming lives and meeting the state's workforce needs. The various parts of the CSU family have been united in arguing the value of the CSU to the state. This unity is very important in our lobbying efforts. It makes our collective voices more effective. We may disagree on other issues, but we need to continue advocating together for CSU funding. Dr. White thanked the faculty, staff and administration for their hard work for student success that has provided results which not only justify the investment by the state but also strengthens our case for additional increased funding in the future. Chancellor White intends to support the Governor's budget and continue to advocate for the funding necessary to allow us to transform even more students' lives. We will be paying close attention to the May Revise Governor's Budget (adjusted for more accurate projections of total state revenues for the year). We still need to increase access to the CSU in order to meet California's 2025 workforce needs. We are hopeful the state will issue a facilities bond for the UC and CSU. This would be done via state ballot in 2020. We anticipate that we would receive about \$4b from this bond. Timing (March primary vs. November general election) needs to be considered strategically. Sponsorship is another issue. We are very grateful for the one-time funds to address some of the deferred maintenance backlog. However, the bond is likely the only avenue to adequately address this growing problem. **In response to questions:** Dr. White supports the "Tenets of Shared Governance" document. There is no need for Board ratification nor Executive Order to give it more

standing. He hopes the ASCSU will endorse it. We are continuing to look at the potential for moving increased numbers of faculty from contingency to TT status. The tenets document is forward looking. It is difficult to predict the effect that adopting the tenets document may have on previous administrative actions. We will continue to look at potential conflicts of interest regarding adoption of instructor-authored course materials. We are exploring many ways to support our underserved students including financial aid augmentations. The potential bond would be a general obligation bond with debt service paid by the state. We would likely spend most of the funds on maintenance, upgrades, and retrofitting. Chancellor White seemed supportive of allowing some flexibility in implementing EO 1100 at CSUB and other campuses. He pointed to a member of the GE Task Force and requested that attention be paid to my (Senator Tarjan's) request for flexibility in implementation. Regarding Civil Discourse: We need to balance the need for universities to address difficult issues and questions with the desire to be supportive and inclusive of our diverse community. The CSU, Fresno "Principles of Community" <http://fresnostate.edu/president/strategic-plan/principles-of-community.html> is an attempt to strike this balance. We need to foster inclusivity. Free speech needs to be free but we need to concomitantly be inclusive in our interactions and discourse. The price of free speech may be that our values are sometimes violated by members of our community.

10. Dean Kulju, Director of Student Financial Aid Services and Suzanne D. Phillips, Interim AVC made a presentation about financial aid and Cal Grants. 81% of our students receive at least some financial aid. 59% of our undergraduate students have their full tuition waived or covered by financial aid (meaning only 41% pay even partial tuition out-of-pocket). 51% of CSU baccalaureate students graduate with no debt. The average loan debt of the remaining 49% was about \$17k vs. a much higher national average for student debt. Eligibility criteria for Cal Grants was reviewed as well as the different type of awards. See <https://www.csac.ca.gov/cal-grants> for more information on Cal Grants. There are some unintended consequences from the eligibility criteria that we hope will be addressed via legislation. Several suggestions for improving the program are being discussed with representatives and staff in Sacramento. This report will be repeated at the Board of Trustees meeting next week during the Committee on Educational Policy. <https://www2.calstate.edu/csu-system/board-of-trustees/past-meetings/2019/Documents/jan-22-23-ed-pol.pdf> **In response to questions:** The state still only provides \$35m of funding for State University Grants, despite the total amount allocated by the CSU growing to \$700m. The CSU has to make up the shortfall (Tarjan: in essence, not collecting tuition money from a significant percentage of needy students whose other financial aid does not fully cover tuition). Campuses with a higher percentage of students receiving SUGsm in essence, are subsidized by campuses with lower percentages of students receiving SUGs through system budget practices. (Tarjan: To not do so would mean campuses like SLO would receive significantly more tuition revenue per student than would Bakersfield if these adjustments were not made.)

CSU Financial Aid (Big Picture) 2017- 18 Preliminary Numbers

- **Nearly 390,000** CSU students received aid (81% of all students)
 - Over **\$4.5 billion** in total financial aid
 - **59%** of all undergraduates have full cost of tuition covered by grants, scholarships or waivers
 - **51%** of CSU Bachelor's recipients graduate with zero student debt
-

•The average loan debt for CSU students was **\$17,367** in 2017, compared with the national average of **\$28,650**

11. Kaila Cooper (CSSA Liaison) was joined by several other CSSA officers. They have been considering/taking positions on executive compensation, support for undocumented students, student trustee selection, their legislative agenda, the Governor's Budget, student basic needs, student financial aid, parking, faculty hiring, alternative forms of transportation, etc. In response to the same question asked of Chancellor White on civil discourse, racism, and classism, CSSA officers provided thoughtful student perspectives on their views and approaches to supporting an inclusive and safe environment focused on student wellbeing.

12. James Swartz (ERFSA Liaison) reported on recent developments, including implementing the name/membership eligibility changes. Note: ERFSA provides many very valuable resources for retired and nearly-retired CSU employees. The website is particularly valuable. <http://csuerfa.org/>

Link to Latest CSU Tenure Density Report

http://www.calstate.edu/hr/faculty-resources/research-analysis/documents/Tenure_Density_and_SFR_Trends_2009-18.pdf